

JSAH, 60,2 2001 TOC & Abstracts

Celik/Winston

The June 2001 issue of the Journal of the Society of Architectural Historians will be mailed in the first week of June.

VOLUME 60 NUMBER 2 JUNE 2001

TABLE OF CONTENTS

ARTICLES:

136 From Caesarea to Athens: Greek Revival Edinburgh and the Question of Scottish Identity within the Unionist State

JOHN LOWREY

158 Engaging the Mind's Eye: The Use of Inscriptions in the Architecture of Owen Jones and A.W.N. Pugin

CAROL A. HRVOL FLORES

180 Tradition and Transformation: Continuity and Ingenuity in the Temples of Karnataka

ADAM HARDY

200 Louis Sullivan's First National Bank Building (1919-1942), Manistique, Michigan

ROBERT TWOMBLY

EXHIBITIONS:

208 Utopia: The Search for the Ideal Society in the Western World, The New York Public Library, New York City, 14 October 2000 -27 January 2001; REVIEWED BY NICHOLAS OLSBERG

Before and After the End of Time: Architecture and the Year 1000, Fogg Art Museum, Harvard University, Cambridge, Massachusetts, 26 August 2000-31 December 2000; REVIEWED BY PETER FERGUSSON

Art and the Empire City: New York, 1825-1861, Metropolitan Museum of Art, New York City, 19 September 2000-7 January 2001; REVIEWED BY EVAN CORNOG

BOOKS:

214 Regional Histories

The Bishop's Palace: Architecture and Authority in Medieval Italy,
by Maureen C. Miller; REVIEWED BY JILL CASKEY

Architecture and Art of the Deccan Sultanates, by George Michell
and Mark Zebrowski; REVIEWED BY ALKA PATEL

Modena 1598: L'invenzione di una capitale, edited by Massimo
Bulgarelli, Claudia Conforti, and Giovanna Curcio; REVIEWED
BY MARTHA POLLAK

Urban Images of the Hispanic World: 1493-1793, by Richard L.
Kagan with the collaboration of Fernando Marias; REVIEWED BY
CATHERINE ZERNER

National Romanticism and Modern Architecture in Germany and
the Scandinavian Countries, by Barbara Miller Lane; REVIEWED
BY HARRY FRANCIS MALLGRAVE

223 Architects

Philbert De l'Orme: Architecte du roi (1514-1570), by
Jean-Marie Pérouse de Montclos; REVIEWED BY ANNE-MARIE SANKOVITCH

Louie Le Vau, Mazarin's Collège, Colbert's Revenge, by
Hilary Ballon; REVIEWED BY CLAUDE MIGNOT

Cast-Iron Architecture in America: The Significance of James
Bogardus, by Margot Gayle and Carol Gayle; REVIEWED BY
DIANA S. WAITE

Sullivan's City: The Meaning of Ornament for Louis Sullivan,
by David Van Zanten; REVIEWED BY LAUREN S. WEINGARDEN

231 Government Architecture

Architects to the Nation: The Rise and Decline of the
Supervising Architect's Office, by Antoinette J. Lee;
REVIEWED BY RICHARD LONGSTRETH

The United States Capitol: Designing and Decorating a National
Icon, edited by Donald R. Kennon; REVIEWED BY PATRICK SNADON

235 Theory

Les Annotations de Guillaume Philandrier sur le De Architectura de
Vitruve, Livres I à IV, edited by Frédérique Lemerle; REVIEWED

BY INGRID D. ROWLAND

The Culture of Building, by Howard Davis; REVIEWED BY DELL UPTON

Warped Space: Art, Architecture, and Anxiety in Modern Culture,
by Anthony Vidler; REVIEWED BY JOAN OCKMAN

240 Technology

The Works: The Industrial Architecture of the United States,
by Betsy Hunter Bradley; REVIEWED BY WILLIAM LITTMANN

The Fireproof Building: Technology and Public Safety in
the Nineteenth-Century American City, by Sara E. Wermiel;
REVIEWED BY LEE GRAY

244 Abstracts

Abstracts

>From Caesarea to Athens: Greek Revival Edinburgh and the Question
of Scottish Identity within the Unionist State

In the early nineteenth century, the city of Edinburgh cultivated a reputation as "the Athens of the North." The paper explores the architectural aspects of this in relation to the city's sense of its own identity. It traces the idea of Edinburgh as a "modern Athens" back to the eighteenth century; when the connotations were cultural, intellectual, and topographical rather than architectural. With the emergence of the Greek revival, however, Edinburgh began actively to construct an image of classical Greece on the hilltops and in the streets of the expanding city. It is argued that the Athenian identity of Edinburgh should be viewed as the culmination of a series of developments dating back to the Act of Union between the Scottish and English Parliaments in 1707. As a result, Edinburgh lost its status as a capital city and struggled to reassert itself against the stronger economy of the south. Almost inevitably, the northern capital had to redefine itself in relation to London, the English and British capital. The major developments of Edinburgh in the eighteenth and early nineteenth centuries, including the New Town and the urban proposals of Robert Adam, are interpreted in this light. As the eighteenth century progressed, the city grew more confident and by the early nineteenth century had settled upon its role within the Union and within the empire, which was that of cultural capital as a counterbalance to London, the political capital.

The architectural culmination of the process of the redefinition

of Edinburgh, however, coincided with the emergence of another mythology of Scottish identity, as seen through the Romantic vision of Sir Walter Scott. It implied a quite different, indigenous architecture that later found its expression in the Scots Baronial style. It is argued here, however, that duality does not contradict the idea of Edinburgh as Athens, nor, more generally, does it sit uneasily with the Scottish predilection for Greek architecture, but rather that it encapsulates the very essence of Scottish national identity: both proudly Scots and British.

JOHN LOWREY

University of Edinburgh

Engaging the Mind's Eye: The Use of Inscriptions in the Architecture of Owen Jones and A.W.N. Pugin

In attempting to create an appropriate architecture for an industrialized world, nineteenth-century architects argued the merits of particular materials and styles and debated principles of ornamentation and polychromatics. Although opposed in many aspects of theory and built form, their works share one aspect, a new interest in the use of inscriptions as emblematic ornamentation. The article proposes Owen Jones's publication of the *Plans, Sections, Elevations and Details of the Alhambra* (1836-1845) as one source for this attention to inscriptions and investigates the significance of the use of text within the decorative schemes produced by the British architects Owen Jones (1809-1874) and A.W.N. Pugin (1812-1852). The article advances the position that although Jones and Pugin had different motives for using inscriptions, both display a comprehension of Islamic ornamentation as understood and explained by Jones. New information on the relationship between Jones and Pugin is introduced and their mutual agreement and involvement in many concerns important in nineteenth-century architecture and the decorative arts are stressed.

In addition, the essay explores the topic of architectural inscriptions theoretically and from a sociocultural perspective, emphasizing the importance of epigraphs within studies of the built environment, ornamentation, and visual culture, as a rich resource for understanding the mentality of a particular period and as a significant expression of the intentions informing aesthetic schemes developed by individual patrons and designers such as Jones and Pugin. Inscriptions are classified and defined in the article as informative, aesthetic, or emblematic, and the ideas and terms introduced in the essay are compared with the

findings and theoretical concepts proposed in the work of the noted Islamicist Oleg Grabar.

CAROL A. HRVOL FLORES

Ball State University

Tradition and Transformation: Continuity and Ingenuity in the Temples of Karnataka

A continuous tradition of Dr̥vida (south Indian) temple architecture flourished in Karnataka, southwest India, between the seventh and thirteenth centuries. This article focuses on the eleventh-century temples, arguing that the later forms can only be understood in relation to the constantly developing tradition, looked at as a whole. A formal analysis is put forward, based primarily on the evidence of the monuments themselves. From the monuments, an appropriate way of seeing can be deduced, allowing an understanding of both individual temple compositions and of the way in which the forms evolve. A clear evolutionary pattern emerges, tending toward dynamism and fusion. Seen retrospectively, there is a sense of inevitability, as if the inherent potential of the architectural language is unfolding. Yet there is great inventiveness. The article illustrates the nature of this inventiveness and discusses its relationship to the evolutionary pattern. It concludes that it was not fixed forms that were passed down, but a way of creating, and that the sense of evolutionary direction this produced can be understood in relation to the world view the temples embody.

ADAM HARDY

De Montfort University, Leicester

Louis Sullivan's First National Bank Building (1919-1922),
Manistique, Michigan

Louis Sullivan's proposals for remodeling the First National Bank Building (1919-1922) in Manistique, Michigan, were executed in part. They reveal his underappreciated ability to bring order to someone else's design chaos by skillfully manipulating the tiniest of details. They also suggest that after his partnership with Dankmar Adler ended in 1895 he refined a vocabulary of façade composition meant to differentiate commercial structures according to program. When newly available archival material is fully exploited, it will likely reveal a good deal more about this neglected building, which was not only Sullivan's sole bank remodeling but also proof that as his career came to a close his ornament remained as powerful as ever.

ROBERT TWOMBLY

The City College of New York

Reference:

TOC: JSAH, 60,2 2001 TOC & Abstracts. In: ArtHist.net, May 3, 2001 (accessed Sep 14, 2025),
<<https://arthist.net/archive/24491>>.